

Very, Many, Small, Penguins

Vaguely Related Topics

Harald A. Bastiaanse

Very, Many, Small, Penguins

Vaguely Related Topics

ILLC Dissertation Series DS-2014-03



INSTITUTE FOR LOGIC, LANGUAGE AND COMPUTATION

For further information about ILLC-publications, please contact

Institute for Logic, Language and Computation

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Science Park 904

1098 XH Amsterdam

phone: +31-20-525 6051

fax: +31-20-525 5206

e-mail: illc@uva.nl

homepage: <http://www.illc.uva.nl/>

Very, Many, Small, Penguins

Vaguely Related Topics

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de
Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. D.C. van den Boom
ten overstaan van een door het college voor
promoties ingestelde commissie, in het openbaar
te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op dinsdag 25 maart 2014, te 10.00 uur

door

Harald Andreas Bastiaanse

geboren te Purmerend.

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: Prof. dr. F.J.M.M. Veltman

Overige leden:

Prof. dr. J.F.A.K. van Benthem

Dr. J.K. Szymanik

Prof dr. R.A.M. van Rooij

Prof. dr. J.F. Horty

Dr. R.A. Muskens

Faculteit der Natuurwetenschappen, Wiskunde en Informatica

The investigations were supported by the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO), as part of the project *On vagueness - and how to be precise enough* (project NWO 360-20-202).

Copyright © 2014 by Harald A. Bastiaanse

Cover design by the author.

Photo on front cover by M. Murphy [Public domain], via Wikimedia Commons

Printed and bound by PrintPartners Ipskamp

ISBN: 978-94-6259-069-4

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
1 Introduction	1
2 The Rationality of Round Interpretation	5
2.1 Introduction	5
2.2 Conditional Probability	6
2.3 Game Theory	8
2.4 Discussion	12
2.4.1 Generalization to Vagueness	12
2.4.2 Schelling Points and Evolutionary Game Theory; a problem?	15
2.5 Appendix: Continuous Scale and k on Probability	17
3 The Intensional Many - Conservativity Reclaimed	19
3.1 Introduction	19
3.2 An Intensional Framework	21
3.2.1 Framework	21
3.2.2 Intensional Conservativity	22
3.2.3 On Scandinavians and the Reverse Reading	24
3.2.4 Other key properties	25
3.2.5 Relation with Extensional Properties	28
3.2.6 General form	28
3.3 Other readings of Many	30
3.4 Appendix A: Reductions	35
3.4.1 Lifting Theorem	35
3.4.2 Extensional Intensional Quantifiers	37
3.5 Appendix B: Characterizing the General Form	39
3.5.1 NUM and Intensional ISOM	42
3.6 Appendix C: Logical Properties of Many - A Brief Glimpse	42

3.6.1	Additivity	43
3.6.2	Reflexivity and anti-Reflexivity	45
3.6.3	Desirability	46
3.6.4	Negative theorems	46
4	A Syllogistic for Subjective Adjectives	51
4.1	Introduction	51
4.2	The Syllogistics	52
4.2.1	Logic	53
4.2.2	An aside: Predicative use	53
4.2.3	General Models	54
4.2.4	Weakly Acceptable Models	55
4.2.5	Acceptable Models	61
4.3	Conclusion	65
5	A Syllogistic Characterization of Gradable Adjectives	67
5.1	Introduction	67
5.2	The Syllogistics	67
5.2.1	Formalism	68
5.3	Characterizing Gradable Adjectives	69
5.3.1	No Reversal	70
5.3.2	No Cycles	72
5.3.3	The Consequences of No Cycles	73
5.4	The Commensurability of Adjective Groups	75
5.4.1	Polar antonyms	77
5.4.2	Evaluative Adjectives and Personal Taste	80
5.4.3	Strictenings and Loosenings	81
5.4.4	The Logic of Commensurability	82
5.5	Vagueness, Distinguishability and The Sorites	83
5.5.1	The Sorites Paradox and Incomplete Judgement	84
5.6	Appendix: Nouns as Contexts	87
6	Making the Right Exceptions	89
6.1	Introduction	89
6.2	Naive Circumscription	90
6.3	Exemption and Inheritance	93
6.3.1	The Exemption Principle	94
6.3.2	The Inheritance Property	96
6.3.3	Some more examples	97
6.3.4	Coherence	99
6.4	Networks	100
6.4.1	Making inferences in inheritance nets	101
6.4.2	Examples	103

6.4.3	An algorithm	106
6.4.4	Completeness	108
6.5	Conclusion	110
6.6	Appendix: Completeness of Networks relative to the Semantics . .	110
6.6.1	New constraints, same consequences	110
6.6.2	Completeness Proof	118
6.6.3	Coherence	122
	Bibliography	125
	Index	129
	Samenvatting	131
	Abstract	135

Acknowledgments

An old law states that it always takes longer than you expect, even if you take that law into account. (Hofstadter 1979, p152) This is certainly how this project has felt for me. That I have managed to complete it successfully despite a variety of setbacks both personal and professional is due in no small part to the help I have received from many people.

First of all I would like to thank my promotor Frank Veltman: for his patience and understanding, for the numerous times he has provided valuable advice and support, but most of all for his solid confidence in my ability. At the time when I most doubted myself, his belief in me was essential in motivating myself to go on. I might not have seen this project through to the end without it.

I would also like to thank Robert van Rooij who at times was almost like a co-promotor, often offering not only useful suggestions on the research but also useful advice on some very practical matters, as well as helping to convince me of the quality and value of, in particular, my first piece.

Through our institute's Vagueness Circle and LeGO Seminar meetings as well as through private e-mail and conversations, many other colleagues in the LoLa group have provided useful comments on both the content and the presentation of the various papers that went into this thesis. For this I would like to thank Bert Baumgaertner, Johan van Benthem, Inés Crespo, Raquel Fernández, Fred Landman, Simon Pauw, Galit Sassoon, Maria Spsychalska, Jakub Szymanik, Lavi Wolf, Lucian Zagan and any others I may have forgotten to list here.

I would also like to thank the anonymous peer reviewers who have given their takes on these papers. While some were more fair and insightful than others, each and every one has contributed to improving the end result.

I would like to thank Cian Chartier, Inés Crespo, Paula Henk, Johannes Marti, Simon Pauw and Ben Rodenhauer for regularly getting me to have lunch in a different building in Cafe Polder and for all the discussions we had, especially the

non-work-related ones.

Finally, I want to thank my family and friends for putting up with and supporting me during my darker hours, and for making sure I got out of the house enough.

Amsterdam
January, 2014.

Harald A. Bastiaanse