Frank Veltman
LOGICS FOR CONDITIONALS
LOGICS FOR CONDITIONALS
LOGICS FOR CONDITIONALS

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van
doctor in de Wijsbegeerte
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam,
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
dr. D.W. Bresters,
hoogleraar in de Faculteit
der Wiskunde en Natuurwetenschappen,
in het openbaar te verdedigen
in de Aula van de Universiteit
(tijdelijk Roetersstraat 15),
op vrijdag 4 oktober 1985
te 14.30 uur

door

FRANCISCUS JACOBUS MARIA MARTINUS VELTMAN
egeboren te Eindhoven
Promotores:
prof. dr. J.F.A.K. van Benthem, Rijksuniversiteit, Groningen
prof. dr. J.A.W. Kamp, University of Texas, Austin
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I do not know to whom I am most indebted, to Johan van
Benthem or to Hans Kamp. What I do know is that this would
have been an altogether different thesis if I had not had
the privilege of having both of them as supervisors. With
his gift for anticipation Hans is the ideal person to air
ones views to – even long before they deserve it. Much of
what is new in the following was inspired by discussions
with him. But where Hans was the one who most encouraged me
to follow up my own ideas, Johan saw to it that I did not
get too wild about them. He has always urged me to put things
in a broader perspective and his comments and questions
determined the final shape of this book.

I am grateful also to my teachers at the University of
Utrecht, my former colleagues at the Erasmus University in
Rotterdam, and my present colleagues at the University of
Amsterdam. In this connection I want to mention in particular
Jeroen van Rijen, Dick de Jongh, Roel de Vrijer, Jeroen
Groenendijk, Martin Stokhof and Fred Landman: Jeroen van
Rijen's ideas on the philosophy of logic greatly influenced
mine; the proofs in this book have benefited much from Dick
de Jongh's mathematical taste; Roel de Vrijer carefully read
the manuscript and suggested several important improvements
on the presentation; Jeroen Groenendijk's and Martin Stokhof's
preoccupation with the role of background information in
matters of semantics and pragmatics has been of great
importance for the development of my own views; and Fred
Landman gets the prize for asking the nastiest questions.

As will become clear from the notes many other people
have by their suggestions and criticism contributed to the
contents of this book. I cannot here mention each of them by
name, but I am grateful to all of them.

As for editorial matters, I am greatly indebted to Michael Morreau who tried his utmost to turn my double Dutch into readable English. Marjorie Pigge typed this book and I want to thank her for the great care with which she did so.

This book has been nearing completion for quite some time. Now that it is finally finished, I would like to dedicate it to all those who are relieved that it is.

Amsterdam
August, 1985

Frank Veltman
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements

PART I: THE PROBLEM OF CONDITIONALS

I.1. METHODOLOGICAL REMARKS 1
I.1.1. The case of the marbles 2
I.1.2. Logic as a descriptive science 5
I.1.2.1. The rationalist tradition 7
I.1.2.2. The empirical approach 9
I.1.3. A more pragmatic view 14

I.2. EXPLANATORY STRATEGIES 22
I.2.1. Logical validity 23
I.2.1.1. The standard explanation 23
I.2.1.2. Truth and evidence 29
I.2.1.3. Probability semantics 32
I.2.1.4. Relevance Logic 38
I.2.2. Pragmatic correctness 40
I.2.3. Logical form 44

Notes to Part I 49

PART II: POSSIBLE WORLDS SEMANTICS 52

(mainly on counterfactual conditionals)

II.1. PRELIMINARIES 52
II.1.1. Worlds and propositions 52
II.1.2. Logical notions 61

II.2. DELINEATIONS 68
II.2.1. Constraints on consequents 68
II.2.2. Constraints on antecedents 78

II.3. ALTERNATIVES 90
II.3.1. Ramsey's suggestion and Stalnaker's theory 90
II.3.2. Comparative similarity according to Lewis 99
II.3.3. Premise semantics 108
II.3.4. Comparative similarity induced 113
II.4. MODELTHEORETIC RESULTS
   II.4.1. Comparing ordering functions and selection functions
   II.4.2. The completeness of $\mathcal{P}$
   II.4.3. Extensions of $\mathcal{P}$

Notes to Part II

PART III: DATA SEMANTICS
   (mainly on indicative conditionals)
   III.1. SEMANTIC STABILITY AND INSTABILITY
       III.1.1. Information models
       III.1.2. Between assertability and truth
       III.1.3. Data logic. Preliminaries
   III.2. PRAGMATIC CORRECTNESS AND INCORRECTNESS
       III.2.1. Gricean constraints
       III.2.2. Odd conditionals
       III.2.3. A test for pragmatic correctness
   III.3. DATA LOGIC
       III.3.1. Deduction principles
       III.3.2. Completeness and decidability
   III.4. PROBLEMS AND PROSPECTS
       III.4.1. Data lattices
       III.4.2. Complex conditionals
       III.4.3. Counterfactuals

Notes to Part III

References

Samenvatting (summary in Dutch)